

ScienceDirect



The psychological structure, social consequences, function, and expression of pride experiences

Eric Mercadante, Zachary Witkower and Jessica L Tracy



Pride is a positively valenced emotion that occurs in response to success and is comprised of two distinct facets: authentic pride, characterized by feelings of accomplishment and confidence; and hubristic pride, characterized by feelings of arrogance and conceit. The two facets diverge in their associations with a range of personality traits and social consequences, but they share a nonverbal expression and evolutionary function. Specifically, both pride facets facilitate the attainment of social rank, but in notably different ways: authentic pride motivates hard work to get ahead, whereas hubristic pride is associated with more antisocial and dishonest means to high status. In closing, we discuss how knowledge of pride can inform research into other positive emotions.

Address

University of British Columbia, Canada

Corresponding author:

Mercadante, Eric (eric.mercadante@psych.ubc.ca)

Current Opinion in Behavioral Sciences 2021, 39:130-135

This review comes from a themed issue on Positive Affect

Edited by Henk van Steenbergen, Disa Sauter, Blair Saunders and Gilles Pourtois

For a complete overview see the <u>Issue</u> and the <u>Editorial</u>

Available online 10th April 2021

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cobeha.2021.03.010

2352-1546/© 2021 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

What made you get out of bed this morning? Perhaps you felt energized by the morning sunshine, and simply could not resist throwing off the covers and jumping up to face the day, but, more realistically, you probably woke to a loud, persistent alarm and immediately remembered a long list of goals you hoped to accomplish. You might have been motivated to achieve these goals by a range of emotions, such as fear of disappointing your boss, or excitement about pursuing a personal passion. Indeed, individuals vary in the motivations that push them to attain their goals and the emotions that underlie those motivations. However, there is one emotion and corresponding motivation that seems to be widely shared by humans and to promote the attainment of a vast range of goals: pride, and the desire to feel it [1*].

Pride is the emotional response to internally attributed success in a valued domain [2]. Yet despite this fairly simple definition, pride experiences are often very different from each other. This highlights a unique feature of this emotion: it is not just one thing.

Psychological structure of pride

Research on the structure of pride has distinguished between two facets, most frequently referred to as authentic and hubristic pride [3–6]. Authentic pride is characterized by feelings of accomplishment and confidence, and typically stems from successes attributed to controllable and unstable causes (e.g. effort). It is the generally prosocial facet of pride that people feel in response to hard-earned successes and moral behaviors. In contrast, hubristic pride is characterized by feelings of arrogance and egotism, stems from successes attributed to uncontrollable and stable causes (e.g. natural talent), and is the more anti-social facet — evidenced by trait-level associations with a range of problematic outcomes including aggression, lying, and misbehavior [7,8].

At the trait-level, people high in authentic pride demonstrate adaptive personality profiles marked by high levels of Extraversion, Agreeableness, Conscientiousness, Emotional Stability, and Openness to Experience, whereas hubristically proud individuals tend to be low in both Agreeableness and Conscientiousness [6]. Those high in authentic pride also tend to have high self-esteem and psychological well-being, whereas those high in hubristic pride have low self-esteem, are typically narcissistic and prone to shame, and more likely to suffer from anxiety and other psychopathologies [8].

Importantly, mixed findings have emerged regarding the attributional antecedents of authentic and hubristic pride [9°,10], and this has led several scholars to propose that the critical distinction between authentic and hubristic pride, at least as measured by the Authentic and Hubristic Pride Scales [6], is not an attributional one. Holbrook *et al.* [10] further assert that hubristic pride may not represent a distinct form of pride, but rather a self-judgment that one's feelings of pride are excessive and unwarranted. Although it is possible that those who report high levels of hubristic pride are critically judging themselves for feeling the relevant socially undesirable items, like egotistical and arrogant, Holbrook et al.'s [10] findings do not provide any empirical support for this claim. To support their suggestion, studies would need to show that those who report hubristic pride also indicate that they feel badly

Domain	Authentic pride	Hubristic pride
Self-evaluation		
Explicit self-esteem ^f	.50*	−.14 [*]
Implicit self-esteem ^g	.26*	10
Self-efficacy ^e	.62***	06
Narcissism ^f	.32*	.22*
Shame-proneness ^f	−.28 [*]	.09*
Big five personality factors		
Extraversion ^f	.39*	.11
Agreeableness ^f	.19*	−.26*
Conscientiousness ^f	.38*	25*
Emotional stability ^f	.28*	05
Openness ^f	.29*	.01
Attributions for success		
Effort attributions ^f	.17*	−.10*
Ability attributions ^f	.02	.09*
Interpersonal emotions and functioning		
Authenticity ⁹	.46*	11 *
Envy ^e	.05	.27***
Fear of negative evaluation ^e	33***	.17***
Petty crimes and misbehaviors ⁹	05	.20*
Aggression ^g	−.20 [*]	.26*
Dyadic adjustment ^g	.24*	−.11 *
Prejudice ^a	12***	.29***
Peer-rated dominance ^c	.01	.36**
Peer-rated prestige ^c	.33*	01
Goal pursuit		
Reward sensitivity ^b	.27***	.21***
Punishment sensitivity ^b	15***	14***
Self-control ^b	.31***	24***
Perseverance ^b	.41***	18***
Intrinsic motivation ^d	.37***	11*
Extrinsic motivation ^d	.05	.10*

about themselves for those feelings, and that they do not in fact feel the feelings they have endorsed on the hubristic pride scale (i.e. a participant would need to indicate something along the lines of, "I endorsed the item 'arrogant' because I don't like my arrogance, but not because I actually felt arrogant.") More broadly, the empirical critiques that have been brought against the two-facet model of pride thus far speak to only one component of the original model—a component that may, in fact, need amending. Setting their attributional findings aside, the majority of Holbrook et al.'s [10] account of the two facets is consistent with the Tracy and Robins' [6] model. These authors agree that pride is not a unitary construct; it is likely comprised of two facets with distinct but related evolutionary origins (see section titled Function below).

Social consequences

Not only do the two facets of pride differ in elicitors, subjective feelings, and associated personality profiles, they also result in notably different social consequences ([1°]; see Table 1). A trait-like tendency to feel authentic pride has been linked to numerous adaptive outcomes such as creativity [11], authenticity, low aggression, healthy relationships [8], adaptive responses to negative evaluations [9°], ethical leadership [12,13], and a prestigious reputation in one's community [14]. In contrast, a trait-like tendency to feel hubristic pride is associated with inauthenticity, aggression, problematic relationships [8], fear of negative evaluations, envy [9°], and a dominant reputation in one's community [14].

Function

Functionalist theories argue that every distinct emotion evolved to serve a distinct function ultimately relevant to humans' survival and reproduction [15-18]. Pride is thought to be functional by promoting behaviors that advance one's social status, thereby helping individuals attain the fitness benefits that come with high social

Figure 1



Prototypical pride expressions, with arms raised (left), and arms akimbo and hands on hips (right). Both displays are reliably recognized at high rates in educated Western samples and by members of isolated small-scale traditional societies.

status, such as increased influence, power, access to resources, and social alliances [19,20,21].

The specific behaviors used to advance social rank, however, vary between the two facets of pride. People intentionally try to feel authentic pride in demanding situations [22°], suggesting that it may facilitate effort. This finding is consistent with research showing that generalized pride experiences (i.e. not specifically assessed as authentic or hubristic) increase effort, persistence, and motivation to work hard during challenging tasks [23-25,26]. Authentic pride is also experienced in response to the successful achievement of long-term goals [27], suggesting that individuals may work hard in order to obtain feelings of authentic pride from personally significant achievements. At the same time, although feelings of authentic pride can enhance performance during a task, the experience of pride after success may have a downside; in this context, pride has been associated with reduced subsequent effort in the same domain [28]. In fact, Weidman et al. [27] found that students who reported low levels of pride in response to poor exam performance subsequently studied harder for their next exam, and performed better as a result—due to that prior absence of desired authentic pride.

In contrast, those high in hubristic pride may adopt a different strategy, leveraging their uninhibited and antisocial tendencies to advance their social rank. Hubristic pride is associated with the social rank attainment strategy of dominance, in which individuals use aggression and intimidation to elicit deference from others via fear of punishment [14,29]. Thus, the feelings of grandiosity and superiority that constitute hubristic pride may be functional by virtue of encouraging individuals to exert dominance over others, ultimately leading to a rise in social rank.

Nonverbal expression

Despite the numerous differences between the two facets of pride, both are communicated with the same static nonverbal expression [30]. This reliably recognized pride expression includes a slight upward head tilt, small smile, expanded chest, and arms extended out from the body either akimbo with hands on hips or raised above the head with hands in fists (see Figure 1). This expression is recognizable among a range of populations, including several small-scale traditional societies with little exposure to Western media, making it unlikely that reliable pride recognition is due to cultural learning ([31]; see Ref. [1°]). Much like experiences of pride, nonverbal expressions of pride also function to enhance social status [31]. However, the effectiveness of these nonverbal displays may depend on whether observers perceive them as genuine; inauthentic or excessive displays of positive emotion after success can lead to negative social judgments and do not necessarily increase the expresser's status [32,33].

Although individuals seem unable to distinguish between the two facets from viewing static posed expressions

alone, other studies suggest that observers can discern each distinct facet from dynamic movements of the head and face [34,35]. In particular, people accurately identify authentic pride from a moving expression involving 'a single fist, an expanded posture, a slight smile, a gaze at the fist, and generally faster movements,' and hubristic pride from a moving expression involving 'hands akimbo, an expanded posture, an asymmetric smile, directed gaze, head titled back, leaning back, and generally slower movements' [34, p. 461]. Not only does this research provide new insight into the nonverbal communication of pride, it also challenges a critique of the two-facet model, which claims that evidence for a single nonverbal expression suggests that pride is unlikely to have two facets [36]. By providing evidence for distinguishable nonverbal displays, these findings are more consistent with the notion that each facet of pride could be a distinct 'natural kind'.

What does the study of pride tell us about research on positive affect?

In addition to advancing our understanding of this socially and morally important emotion, research on pride informs the study of positive affect more generally. Here, we discuss three lessons from pride research that might guide future work in this domain.

Most notably, pride is difficult to classify as either 'positive' or 'negative', because of its two-facet structure. Indeed, pride's status as a positive emotion depends to some extent on which facet of the emotion, and which emotion taxonomy, is prioritized when making this distinction. For taxonomies that stress the intrapersonal valence of the emotion (i.e. how pleasurable it feels), both authentic and hubristic pride can be considered positive [37°], though authentic pride is more strongly associated with pleasant and positive affect [6]. Indeed, the valence of hubristic pride may more accurately be characterized as mixed; it is positively associated with both positive and negative affect, at both the state- and trait-levels [9°]. Thus, if a positive emotion is defined on the basis of being a positive experience for the individual, authentic pride fits the bill, but it is less clear that hubristic pride does.

Similarly, hubristic pride could not be considered an unambiguously positive emotion within taxonomies that categorize positive emotions as those that facilitate the acquisition of informational, social, or material resources [18,38]. By promoting increases in social status [1°], both facets of pride directly help individuals acquire social resources (i.e. social rank), and, as a result, greater material resources [29,39,40]. The two facets differ, however, in how they promote the acquisition of informational resources. Authentic pride is associated with high intrinsic motivation [41], self-control, and perseverance [42], all of which facilitate learning new information. Hubristic pride, in contrast, shows the opposite pattern of relationships [41,42], and may therefore hinder learning.

Another way to classify positive versus negative emotions is on the basis of whether they serve a pro-social versus anti-social function. In this approach, positive emotions are those that motivate the experiencer to behave prosocially, whereas negative emotions motivate the experiencer to behave antisocially. Authentic pride remains a positive emotion in this categorization, due to its many prosocial consequences, but hubristic pride would become negative, given that hubristically proud individuals demonstrate numerous anti-social behaviors [1,8,9]. In fact, perhaps the only categorization approach that places both facets of pride squarely in the positive sector is that based on approach versus avoidance motivation [43,44]; both facets are associated with greater reward seeking and reward sensitivity, making them clearly approach-oriented emotions (i.e. high Behavioral Activation System; [42]).

The association between hubristic pride and anti-social behavior also highlights an interesting truth about positive affect: emotions that feel good can make people do bad things. Pride is a clear example of a positive emotion that may have negative interpersonal consequences, but other seemingly positive emotions might also have this effect, or, like pride, a dark variant awaiting illumination. For example, recent work found that the seemingly positive emotion of gratitude can be costly, by fostering obedience even when that means committing harm [45]. Similarly, other studies have uncovered a more negative, 'threat-based' variant of awe, elicited by vast, complicated, and dangerous phenomena (e.g. natural disasters; [46]).

The dual-faceted nature of pride also has implications for personality, and in particular the close interplay between emotions and personality. Given that the two facets are associated with largely divergent personality profiles, individuals with different personality traits might experience a different facet of pride in response to the same situation. For example, following a promotion at work, a person with high self-esteem might feel authentic pride, but one who is narcissistic might instead feel hubristic pride. Thus, whereas previous research has tended to focus on personality traits that lead people to feel more intense or frequent positive emotions in general (e.g. [18,47]), future work should examine how individual differences influence the discrete kinds of emotions that people feel.

Finally, although the large majority of emotion expression research has focused primarily on the face [48°,49], research on pride highlights how certain emotions require the involvement of the body for reliable recognition. Taking a cue from research on the pride expression, future work on nonverbal displays would benefit from examining the importance of features beyond the face in communicating various emotions (see Ref. [48*] for a review of extant evidence on the bodily communication of emotions). Furthermore, given that the two facets of pride can be reliably differentiated only from dynamic expressions involving the face and body, future work might also examine how movement may allow for more nuanced communication of other emotions. Beyond visual cues, researchers have identified distinct and cross-culturally recognized nonverbal vocal utterances

In conclusion, pride is a unique emotion with a dualfaceted structure. Findings on pride raise important questions and highlight potential research directions for other positive emotions. We hope that the work reviewed here will inspire future research on pride and related emotions.

for several emotions [50], pointing to another important

and often overlooked modality for reliable emotion

Conflict of interest statement

Nothing declared.

communication.

References and recommended reading

Papers of particular interest, published within the period of review, have been highlighted as:

- · of special interest
- Tracy JL, Mercadante E, Witkower Z, Cheng JT: Chapter two—
 the evolution of pride and social hierarchy. In Advances in Experimental Social Psychology, , vol 62. Edited by Gawronski B. Academic Press; 2020:51-114.

This chapter reviews over a decade of research on the evolution of pride and social hierarchy. Particular attention is paid to the relationship between authentic and hubristic pride and prestige and dominance strategies, respectively, and their theorized evolutionary roots.

- Tracy JL, Robins RW: Putting the self into self-conscious emotions: a theoretical model. Psychol Inq 2004, 15:103-125.
- Lewis M: Self-conscious emotions: embarrassment, pride, shame, and guilt. In Handbook of Emotions, edn 2. Edited by Lewis M, Haviland-Jones JM.New York: Guilford; 2000:623-636.
- Miceli M, Castelfranchi C, Pocobello R: The ambiguity of pride. Theory Psychol 2017, 27:550-572.
- Tangney JP, Wagner P, Gramzow R: The Test of Self-Conscious Affect. Fairfax, VA: George Mason University; 1989.
- Tracy JL, Robins RW: The psychological structure of pride: a tale of two facets. J Pers Soc Psychol 2007, 92:506-525.
- Bureau JS, Vallerand RJ, Ntoumanis N, Lafrenière M-AK: On passion and moral behavior in achievement settings: the mediating role of pride. Motiv Emot 2013, 37:121-133.
- Tracy JL, Cheng JT, Robins RW, Trzesniewski KH: Authentic and hubristic pride: the affective core of self-esteem and narcissism. Self Identity 2009, 8:196-213.
- 9. Dickens LR, Robins RW: Pride: a meta-analytic project. Emotion

This paper presents meta-analyses of the relationship between authentic and hubristic pride (as measured by the AHPS; Tracy and Robins [6]) and personality factors, mental health and well-being, social status strategies and outcomes, and cognitive attributional tendencies. Results provide strong evidence for the distinction between authentic and hubristic pride and their theorized relationships with various outcomes.

- Holbrook C, Piazza J, Fessler DMT: Conceptual and empirical challenges to the "authentic" versus "hubristic" model of pride. Emotion 2014, 14:17-32.
- Damian RI, Robins RW: The link between dispositional pride and creative thinking depends on current mood. J Res Pers 2012. 46:765-769.
- 12. Michie S: Pride and gratitude: how positive emotions influence the prosocial behaviors of organizational leaders. *J Leadersh Organ Stud* 2009, **15**:393-403.
- Sanders S, Wisse B, Van Yperen NW, Rus D: On ethically solvent leaders: the roles of pride and moral identity in predicting leader ethical behavior. J Bus Ethics 2018. 150:631-645.
- Cheng JT, Tracy JL, Henrich J: Pride, personality, and the evolutionary foundations of human social status. Evol Hum Behav 2010, 31:334-347.
- Baumeister RF, Vohs KD, DeWall CN, Zhang L: How emotion shapes behavior: feedback, anticipation, and reflection, rather than direct causation. Pers Soc Psychol Rev 2007, 11:167-203.
- Nesse R: Evolutionary explanations of emotions. Hum Nat 1990, 1:261-289.
- Keltner D, Haidt J: Social functions of emotions at four levels of analysis. Cogn Emot 1999, 13:505-521.
- Shiota MN, Campos B, Oveis C, Hertenstein MJ, Simon-Thomas E, Keltner D: Beyond happiness: building a science of discrete positive emotions. Am Psychol 2017, 72:617-643.
- Bolló H, Böthe B, Tóth-Király I, Orosz G: Pride and social status.
 Front Psychol 2018. 9.

Across four studies, findings replicate previously documented relationships between authentic and hubristic pride and prestige and dominance, respectively, and show that subjective social status is more closely related to authentic pride and prestige, but objective social status is more closely related to hubristic pride and dominance.

Cohen AS, Chun R, Sznycer D: Do pride and shame track the evaluative psychology of audiences? Preregistered replications of Sznycer et al. (2016, 2017). R Soc Open Sci 2020, 7:191922

Direct replication of Sznycer et al. [21]. Findings show that people expect to feel pride in a given achievement to the extent that others judge this achievement as socially valuable. These findings support evolutionary accounts of pride as functioning to facilitate status striving.

- 21. Sznycer D, Al-Shawaf L, Bereby-Meyer Y, Curry OS, Smet DD, Ermer E, Kim S, Kim S, Li NP, Seal MFL et al.: Cross-cultural regularities in the cognitive architecture of pride. Proc Nat Acad Sci U S A 2017, 114:1874-1879.
- Weidman AC, Kross E: Examining emotional tool use in daily
 life. J Pers Soc Psychol 2020.

Findings show that people intentionally seek to use emotions as tools to facilitate certain behaviors in relevant situations. In the case of pride, people try to intentionally feel authentic pride in situations that require hard work and persistence, and hubristic pride in situations where they want to intimidate others.

- Sigall H, Gould R: The effects of self-esteem and evaluator demandingness on effort expenditure. J Pers Soc Psychol 1977, 35:12-20.
- Verbeke W, Belschak F, Bagozzi RP: The adaptive consequences of pride in personal selling. J Acad Market Sci 2004, 32:386-402.
- Williams LA, DeSteno D: Pride and perseverance: the motivational role of pride. J Pers Soc Psychol 2008, 94:1007-1017
- Williams LA, DeSteno D: Pride: adaptive social emotion or seventh sin? Psychol Sci 2009, 20:284-288.
- Weidman AC, Tracy JL, Elliot AJ: The benefits of following your pride: authentic pride promotes achievement. J Pers 2016, 84:607-622.
- Seo E, Patall EA: Feeling proud today may lead people to coast tomorrow: daily intraindividual associations between emotion and effort in academic goal striving. *Emotion* 2020.

Across two daily diary studies, findings show that students tend to exert less effort on academics the day after they feel pride in their academic performance. This suggests that feeling pride on one day can lead to coasting' the next.

- 29. Henrich J, Gil-White FJ: The evolution of prestige: freely conferred deference as a mechanism for enhancing the benefits of cultural transmission. Evol Hum Behav 2001, 22:165-
- 30. Tracy JL, Robins RW: Show your pride: evidence for a discrete emotion expression. Psychol Sci 2004, 15:194-197.
- 31. Tracy JL, Shariff AF, Zhao W, Henrich J: Cross-cultural evidence that the nonverbal expression of pride is an automatic status signal. J Exp Psychol Gen 2013, 142:163.
- 32. Greenaway KH, Kalokerinos EK, Murphy SC, McIlroy T: Winners are grinners: expressing authentic positive emotion enhances status in performance contexts. J Exp Soc Psychol 2018, **78**:168-180.
- 33. Kalokerinos EK, Greenaway KH, Pedder DJ, Margetts EA: Don't grin when you win: the social costs of positive emotion expression in performance situations. Emotion 2014, 14:180-
- 34. Lange J, Crusius J: The tango of two deadly sins: the socialfunctional relation of envy and pride. J Pers Soc Psychol 2015, 109:453-472.
- 35. Nelson NL, Russell JA: Dynamic facial expressions allow differentiation of displays intended to convey positive and hubristic pride. *Emotion* 2014, **14**:857-864.
- Williams LA, DeSteno D: Pride in parsimony. Emot Rev 2010, **2**:180-181.
- Weidman AC, Tracy JL: Picking up good vibrations: uncovering the content of distinct positive emotion subjective experience Emotion 2020, 20:1311-1331

Data-driven methods are used to identify the unique and shared elements of 19 positive emotions. Self-report scales for each emotion are developed and validated.

- 38. Fredrickson BL: What good are positive emotions? Rev Gen Psychol 1998, 2:300-319
- 39. Van Vugt M: Evolutionary origins of leadership and followership. Pers Soc Psychol Rev 2006, 10:354-371.

- 40. Van Vugt M, von Rueden CR: From genes to minds to cultures: evolutionary approaches to leadership. Leadersh Q 2020,
- 41. Damian RI. Robins RW: Aristotle's virtue or Dante's deadliest sin? The influence of authentic and hubristic pride on creative achievement. Learn Individ Differ 2013, 26:156-160.
- 42. Carver CS, Sinclair S, Johnson SL: Authentic and hubristic pride: differential relations to aspects of goal regulation, affect, and self-control. J Res Pers 2010, 44:698-703.
- 43. Carver CS, White TL: Behavioral inhibition, behavioral activation, and affective responses to impending reward and punishment: the BIS/BAS scales. J Pers Soc Psychol 1994,
- 44. Harmon-Jones E: Clarifying the emotive functions of asymmetrical frontal cortical activity. Psychophysiology 2003,
- 45. Tong EMW, Ng C-X, Ho JBH, Yap IJL, Chua EXY, Ng JWX, Ho DZY, Diener E: Gratitude facilitates obedience: new evidence for the social alignment perspective. Emotion 2020.
- 46. Gordon A, Anderson C, McNeil G, Loew D, Keltner D: The dark side of the sublime: distinguishing a threat-based variant of awe. J Pers Soc Psychol 2016, 113.
- 47. Costa PT, McCrae RR: Normal personality assessment in clinical practice: the NEO personality inventory. Psychol Assess 1992. 4:5
- 48. Witkower Z, Tracy JL: Bodily communication of emotion:
- evidence for extrafacial behavioral expressions and available coding systems. Emot Rev 2019, 11:184-193.

Authors review evidence for bodily expressions of emotion, along with previously developed coding systems available for identifying emotions from bodily behavior.

- 49. Ekman P, Oster H: Facial expressions of emotion. Ann Rev Psychol 1979, 30:527-554.
- Sauter DA, Eisner F, Ekman P, Scott SK: Cross-cultural recognition of basic emotions through nonverbal emotional vocalizations. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A 2010, 107:2408-2412.
- 51. Ashton-James CE, Tracy JL: Pride and prejudice: how feelings about the self influence judgments of others. Pers Soc Psychol Bull 2012. 38:466-476.